



Scottish **Arts** Council

research and evaluation

The evidence base for arts and culture policy

A brief review of selected recent literature

RES 039 January 2008

Prepared by Susan Galloway, Centre for Cultural Policy Research, University of Glasgow for the Scottish Arts Council.

The views expressed in this report are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of the Scottish Arts Council.

Scottish Arts Council

12 Manor Place, Edinburgh EH3 7DD

Telephone 0131 226 6051

Facsimile 0131 225 9833

Typetalk please prefix number with 18001

Help Desk 0845 603 6000 (local rate)

E-mail help.desk@scottisharts.org.uk

Website www.scottisharts.org.uk

Equal opportunities

The Scottish Arts Council operates an equal opportunities policy. Our offices have disabled access. Certain publications can be made available in Gaelic, in large print, Braille or audio format.

January 2008

© 2008 Scottish Arts Council

No part of this publication may be reproduced in any format without prior written permission of the Scottish Arts Council.

Chapter		Page
	Executive Summary	
0	Introduction	1
1	Wealthier and fairer	4
2	Healthier	13
3	Safer and stronger	19
4	Smarter	24
5	Greener	28
	Conclusions	31
	Bibliography	33
	Appendix: Additional references	38

Executive Summary

1 Aims and objectives

- 1.1 This brief literature scan, covering the period 2004 – 2007, reviews some of the key research evidence about the contribution of culture to the Scottish Government's five strategic objectives: Wealthier and Fairer, Healthier, Safer and Stronger, Smarter and Greener.
- 1.2 It is not a comprehensive appraisal of the evidence base but presents the findings of selected key literature added to the Scottish Government's Impact Database since February 2004, when *'The literature review of the evidence base for culture, the arts and sports policy'* by Janet Ruiz was published. It concentrates on the areas where Ruiz identified an evidence gap and highlights remaining gaps.
- 1.3 It adopts the definition used by Ruiz: "Museums, galleries, libraries, theatre, literature, music, dance, festivals, crafts, exhibitions, film/video, art classes (i.e. in schools), design (i.e. in hospitals) and leisure activities (i.e. reading, playing a musical instrument, going to the cinema etc" (Ruiz, 2004:16). It does not cover sport.
- 1.4 Of necessity the review is highly selective and both this summary and the report should be read with this in mind. The determination of which research subjects fit with the government's strategic objectives has also been fairly strict.

2 Overview

- 2.1 Literature reviews and evaluations commissioned by government departments or agencies (NDPBs) form a large part of the work published since 2004. This highlights the extent to which cultural research is dominated by government political agendas, but also demonstrates the extent to which funding bodies have been investing resources in addressing the identified weaknesses and gaps in the evidence base.
- 2.2 Over the past three years commissioned research has addressed five of the six areas in which Ruiz identified gaps in evidence. Three of these areas - health, education and employment – directly relate to government strategic objectives and some of this work is reported below.

Strategic Objective 1: Wealthier and fairer

Enable businesses and people to increase their wealth and more people to share fairly in that wealth

- 2.3 The focus of recent public policy, and research, has been on the economic importance and wealth generating potential of the creative sector rather than on how this wealth is shared (the 'fairer' part of the strategic objective). Research output reflects the prevalence in public policy of creative industries/creative economy thinking and interest in the role of culture in

regeneration.

- 2.4 Recently published work provides a good body of evidence about the employment and economic value of the creative sectors at European and UK level (conceptual and methodological issues notwithstanding). The creative industries are estimated to account for 7.3% of the UK economy, comparable in size to the financial services industry, and to employ directly 1 million people (The Work Foundation, 2007).
- 2.5 There is a growing body of evidence about the effects of culture on environmental, economic and social regeneration, and this 'goes well beyond mere boosterism' (Landry et al, 2004). However there are limitations to this evidence base, key issues being sustainability and the question of cultural impact, and a longer term approach to evaluating cultural and social impacts has been called for. Methods for measuring these are considered under-developed and a range of barriers to improving the range and quality of evidence through improved evaluation work has been identified.

Gaps

- 2.6 The question of whether the wealth generated by Scotland's creative sector is shared fairly presents a new field of inquiry for cultural research.

In addition, authors identify persistent gaps in relation to:

- A comprehensive evaluation model for large scale culture led regeneration, involving for example, major events and flagship cultural venues;
- the sustainability of impacts;
- the evaluation of cultural impacts (rarely considered) and how these interact with social and economic impacts;
- longitudinal comparative research of culture-led regeneration initiatives;
- the effects of visual arts on individuals, communities, localities.

Strategic Objective 2: Healthier

Help people to sustain and improve their health, especially in disadvantaged communities, ensuring better, local and faster access to health care.

- 2.7 Arts and health has emerged as a key policy priority over the past few years, reflected in research commissioning. Recent research focuses on the first part of the strategic objective, health improvement.
- 2.8 There is now a strong body of work on arts and health, mainly in the form of literature and systematic reviews. The main focus of these is on the art in clinical settings and the role of the arts in mental health and community health. They present clear and reliable evidence about a range of positive clinical outcomes attributable to the arts in healthcare settings. Studies show that the use of arts can cause positive physiological and psychological changes in clinical outcomes; reduce drug consumption; reduce length of stay in hospital; increase job satisfaction; improve doctor-patient relationships; improve mental healthcare; and

develop health practitioners' empathy across gender and cultural diversity.

- 2.9 Arising from the UK government's Social Inclusion agenda, progress has been made over the past few years in reviewing and moving forward the evidence base for the arts in the field of mental health. The first large scale evaluation undertaken in the UK using validated psychological measures (Anglia Ruskin/UCLan, 2007) found strong evidence that arts participation contributes to empowerment, mental health and social inclusion and that these gains are greater for individuals with clinically significant mental health issues.
- 2.10 Research gaps identified by the literature include:
- the impact on health in community settings (i.e. non-clinical settings);
 - a longitudinal study with a large sample investigating the impact of the arts on individual mental health and well-being particularly the issue of sustainability;
 - further research on music and musical instruments in relation to the clinical setting;
 - the effect of integrating different artforms into the healthcare culture with respect to social inclusion and cultural diversity;
 - arts and humanities as a contributory factor in recruiting and training staff in the health sector.

Strategic Objective 3: Safer and stronger

Help local communities to flourish, becoming stronger, safer places to live, offering improved opportunities and a better quality of life.

- 2.11 Much of the recent work linked to this objective has been commissioned by funding departments and agencies seeking evidence of the contribution of the arts and heritage to the government's social policy aims. In particular the contribution of culture to building social capital, and thereby strengthening communities and tackling social exclusion, has become a growing area for cultural research.
- 2.12 Most authors who have reviewed the evidence conclude that there is currently limited empirical evidence about the impact of arts and cultural activities at community, neighbourhood, or 'group level'. The difficulties are both conceptual – the terms social capital and social inclusion are contested and problematic, and there is often a confusing overlap of closely related concepts – and methodological, related to the limitations of social research. Research or evaluation methods for investigating/appraising the impacts of arts participation on individuals are relatively under-developed. Empirical evidence showing how these individual level effects translate at group or community level appears scarce. In summary more empirical research is needed to test existing theories about cultural and social capital. A comprehensive review of existing research in this area would be instructive.
- 2.13 Gaps identified in the literature include:

- identifying the social impact of culture at a group or neighbourhood, rather than individual level;
- the role of arts in cultural diversity, community health and community regeneration;
- *Museums, libraries archives:*
- A lack of longitudinal, comparative data on social impact
- A lack of an agreed conceptual model for describing impact
- A relative lack of research into the social impact of museums, libraries and archives on cultural diversity, health and mental health.

Strategic Objective 4: Smarter

Expand opportunities for Scots to succeed from nurture through to life long learning ensuring higher and more widely shared achievements.

- 2.14 Evidence of the effects of arts participation on educational attainment and future employability has previously been identified as a key gap (Ruiz, 2004) and as a result this has been a priority area for commissioned research over the past few years. Recent publications have looked at the effectiveness of the Arts-Education Interface Initiative (part of Education Action Zones) and the Creative Partnerships programme in England and the Youth Music Initiative in Scotland.
- 2.15 Evaluations of recent public interventions using the arts in school education have found strong evidence that these produce benefits for pupils in terms of personal development (for example, self esteem, self confidence, social skills, awareness of others), affective outcomes (e.g. enjoyment, pride, sense of achievement) and academic attainment (where a small but statistically significant gain has been detected). For some, but not all, pupils a significant improvement in key skills including literacy, numeracy and ICT has been attributed to the arts. There is substantial academic research activity in this area and a meta-review of recent studies would be more productive than commissioning new work.
- 2.16 In a different area of education, within the criminal justice field, evaluation of the arts as a medium for offender rehabilitation has identified similar types of positive effects, which vary for different individuals. These include positive changes in 'engagement, self-esteem, confidence, self-control and the ability to co-operate'. The culture of arts interventions and their physical context were found to be key contributory factors. However longer term research is needed to investigate whether these 'indicators of change' play a role in any significant life changes.

Strategic Objective 5: Greener

Improve Scotland's natural and built environment and the sustainable use and enjoyment of it.

- 2.17 In contrast to the contribution of culture to the physical environment, published research on culture and the sustainable use and enjoyment of the

natural environment is scarce. The single study reviewed here found the integration of artwork into the natural environment can encourage people to rediscover their local green spaces and heighten their awareness and appreciation of it.

- 2.18 There is strong evidence of the environmental (physical) impacts associated with culture-led regeneration, both positive and negative. Positive impacts are achieved by cultural initiatives which encourage the re-use of redundant buildings, greater public use of open spaces and the mixed use of urban space. These types of initiatives have been found to reduce traffic and fear of crime, increase sense of safety and a sense of pride of place. However this is balanced by evidence of the negative impacts of culture-led '24 hour city' developments and the area gentrification which often results from regeneration initiatives. Extensive evidence exists for the environmental, social and economic impact – both positive and negative - of architecture and design as well as about the design attributes which contribute to these.

Gaps

- 2.19 The literature reviewed identifies gaps in evidence relating to:
- the impact of culture on the natural environment and on environmental sustainability, including public transport;
 - Holistic integrated approaches to evaluating flagship major cultural projects, including cultural buildings/venues, sensitive to the relationships between cultural, economic and social impacts, both positive and negative.
 - The evaluation of the long-term environmental, social and economic impact of architecture and design.
 - A common evaluation framework for architecture and design initiatives.

3 Conclusions

- 3.1 The publications reviewed in this brief and selective literature scan add to what is now a strong body of evidence for the contribution of arts and culture to three of the five strategic objectives of the Scottish Government: 1, Wealthier, 2, Healthier and 4, Smarter.
- 3.2 The findings of some studies support the contribution of arts and culture to strategic objective 3, Safer and Stronger, but the sample of literature reviewed indicates conflicting evidence about the community-level impact of arts and culture, specifically in relation to social capital and social inclusion.
- 3.3 In relation to strategic objective 5, Greener, there is strong evidence, both positive and negative, about the impact of culture-led regeneration and of architecture and design on the built environment, but little available research evidence relating to the natural environment.
- 3.4 Many of the pieces of commissioned work reviewed here, and other work not included, have been about assessing the difficulties in developing evidence of impact and looking at ways to overcome these, including the piloting of methodologies and research approaches (Evans and Shaw, 2004, Oakley,

2004, Anglia Ruskin/UCLAN Research Team, 2005, 2006a, b; Miles and Clarke, 2006). This work has moved things on quite significantly, helping the evidence base to catch up with policy.

- 3.5 In terms of improving the research evidence for the impact of arts and culture overall a consistent theme in the literature reviewed is the need for a longer term approach to evaluating cultural interventions. Authors writing across a range of contexts urge the need for larger scale, longer term studies in order to investigate long term impact, and the question of sustainability. Thus one of the main conclusions of Ruiz' 2004 literature review remains relevant three years on.

0 Introduction

0.1 Aims and objectives

- 0.1.1 The purpose of this brief literature scan is to review some of the recent evidence about the contribution of culture to the government's five strategic objectives: Wealthier and Fairer, Healthier, Safer and Stronger, Smarter and Greener. The review was commissioned by the Scottish Arts Council to inform policy and planning but also to assist in providing the evidence of outcomes required of all Non-departmental Public Bodies by the Scottish Government.
- 0.1.2 The review concentrates on arts and heritage, adopting the definition used by Ruiz: "Museums, galleries, libraries, theatre, literature, music, dance, festivals, crafts, exhibitions, film/video, art classes (i.e. in schools), design (i.e. in hospitals) and leisure activities (i.e. reading, playing a musical instrument, going to the cinema etc" (Ruiz, 2004:16). It does not cover sport as the recent sports literature has been separately reviewed by sportscotland.
- 0.1.3 It covers the period since February 2004 when the Scottish Government published, '*A literature review of the evidence base for culture, the arts and sports policy*', by Janet Ruiz. However unlike Ruiz' 2004 review, this cannot be a comprehensive survey and appraisal of the evidence base.
- 0.1.4 The present review is primarily descriptive: its aim is to identify and succinctly present the findings of selected key literature added to the Impact database since February 2004, particularly in areas where Ruiz identified an evidence gap, and to identify any remaining gaps. Of necessity the review is highly selective. The method of selection is described as transparently as possible.
- 0.1.5 Because of its selective nature, the determination of which research subjects fit with the government's strategic objectives has also been fairly strict. Only publications directly related to the strategic objectives, as officially defined, have been included. Research areas tangentially or indirectly related to the objectives have been ruled out.
- 0.1.6 The Appendix lists details of other key selected literature which it was not possible to include in the main report.

0.2 Methodology

- 0.2.1 The source used is the Scottish Government's Impact Database, a comprehensive source of information on the 'evidence base' for arts and culture. It contains the citations from the review undertaken by Ruiz, supplemented by details of all relevant research published since. Since October 2004 the Centre for Cultural Policy Research (CCPR) has been responsible for updating and hosting the database. It holds records of all published research, domestic and international, concerned with the impact of culture and major events (including major sporting events) on other policy fields. These are identified through ongoing searches of a wide range of academic and non-academic sources. Work based on case studies is included only if it discusses or assesses impact, but not if it clearly only advocates or describes a certain study. Publications clearly

identifiable as advocacy are excluded.

- 0.2.2 The initial basis for the review comprised 297 articles: the 217 articles added to the database since Ruiz' review was completed, plus 80 publications recently selected to be assessed for inclusion. In stage 1 of the selection process 114 of the 297 articles were selected as being clearly relevant to the five government objectives. In stage 2 the abstract or executive summary of each was read and assessed against the criteria determined for key literature, which included either literature or systematic reviews; new empirically based research or evaluation, particularly in areas where this is scarce or missing; and new work by research centres or researchers specialising in impact research. The overarching criterion was strong research findings linking arts and culture to the strategic objectives.
- 0.2.3 The final selection of articles was categorised by research type and it was decided to prioritise literature reviews and large(r) scale research or evaluations.

0.3 Overview

- 0.3.1 The report is structured around the government's five strategic objectives. There is some overlap between these objectives and this is reflected in the literature and noted in the text. An example is physical and mental health and social inclusion which are closely linked in current policy thinking. The limited scope of the review precludes a thematic analysis of the findings and so in each section the articles are grouped by report format.
- 0.3.2 Ruiz (2004, 5) identified gaps in research evidence in the following areas:
- 1 **well-being and quality of life:** often cited as outcomes of arts interventions, but rarely with any attempt at definition or measurement.
 - 2 **arts within the prison system:** where evaluation has been lacking and where longitudinal work is needed to assess the longer term outcomes.
 - 3 **arts and health:** where 'more formal outcome evaluation' is needed, investment in large scale evaluations, and assessments of the financial savings attributable to arts interventions.
 - 4 **creativity in education:** identified a need for longitudinal research into the role and impact of creativity within statutory education.
 - 5 **employment:** need for research or evaluation to identify the impact of cultural participation on the future employment of individuals.
 - 6 **art as itself:** research is needed on the intrinsic nature of art and what the arts mean to people.
- 0.3.3 Three of these areas - health, education and employment (highlighted) – directly relate to government strategic objectives and these have been the subject of commissioned research over the past three years. With regard to the other areas, the Scottish Government has commissioned research into the contribution of culture to quality of life and well-being (Galloway et al, 2006) and research aimed at improving the evidence base for the arts in criminal justice settings has

been commissioned by DCMS, the UK Department for Education and ACE (Miles and Clarke, 2006). The latter report, produced by the Centre for Research on Socio- Economic Change (CRESC) at Manchester University, concentrated on arts in prisons and is reported here under the government objective 'Smarter', concerned with providing opportunities for individuals to succeed.

- 0.3.4 Literature reviews and evaluations commissioned by government departments or agencies (NDPBs) form a large part of the new work published since 2004. This highlights the extent to which cultural research is dominated by government policy agendas, but also demonstrates the extent to which funding bodies have been investing resources in addressing the identified weaknesses and gaps in the evidence base. Over the past three years, in a number of areas, including regeneration, employment, mental health, and social inclusion, some excellent pieces of commissioned research and evaluation work have been published, which aim not just to appraise the existing evidence but to make constructive recommendations for improving future evaluation. Some of these are critical and reflexive pieces of work that give a realistic appraisal of the philosophical and methodological issues involved, as well as the politics of evidence-based policymaking.

1 Wealthier and fairer

1.1 Enable businesses and people to increase their wealth and more people to share fairly in that wealth

1.1.1 The focus of public policy, and recent research, has been on the economic importance and wealth generating potential of the creative sector rather than on how this wealth is shared (the 'fairer' part of the strategic objective).

1.1.2 Assessments of the economic impact of particular events, venues or projects, mainly US studies, form a large part of the output in this area. Many of these are advocacy driven, and the findings are seldom of wider significance. This brief summary concentrates on the large scale economic assessments of the arts and cultural sector published in the last three years, several substantial literature reviews on the subject of economic regeneration and a few selected UK economic impact studies that are of interest in this context.

1.1.3 Research output has been closely tied to public policy and reflects the prevalence of creative industries thinking and interest in the role of culture in regeneration. The Scottish Government's emphasis on the fair sharing of wealth may possibly redirect the focus onto labour market issues including persistent low income and pay, gender inequalities, insecurity, and the sustainability of creative careers.

1.2 Large scale assessments of economic impact of cultural sector as a whole:

1.2.1 In recent years, much attention has been paid by government at various levels to the issue of arts and culture in relation to the economy, as the policy focus has shifted away from traditional industrial sectors and towards what has become known as 'the knowledge economy', 'the cultural industries', 'the creative sector' or 'creative economy'. However, the definition of this 'sector' - especially in terms of objective measures for research and collection of national statistics - has been problematic. Two recent government-sponsored research projects, one by the European Commission and the other by the UK Department for Culture, Media and Sport have now laid out broadly similar conceptual frameworks for the creative sector. These both identify a 'core' of arts and cultural production. The European research quotes Throsby's (1) tripartite characterisation of culture as involving 'creativity', 'generation and communication of symbolic means', and 'intellectual property', while the DCMS document speaks of the 'origination of ideas of expressive value'. This arts/culture core is surrounded by 'cultural industries' such as film and television, which involve mass reproduction of the intellectual property created by the core. These are in turn surrounded by 'creative industries' such as design or advertising, whose activities depend on the 'creativity' of the arts/culture core and the cultural industries.

1.3 Europe

1.3.1 A major research publication published by the European Commission's Directorate-General for Education and Culture, *The economy of culture in Europe* (KEA European Affairs, 2006), studies the direct and indirect socio-economic impact of the cultural and creative sector in Europe. The objective of this

research was to assess the contribution of the sector to the Lisbon agenda of 2000 (a ten year plan for economic action and development in the European Union), particularly in terms of realising growth, competitiveness, more and better jobs, sustainable development and innovation.

- 1.3.2 The study developed a specific methodology in order to approach a definition of the cultural sector across the EU, primarily using existing statistical classifications that embrace the sector, and collecting Eurostat data corresponding to these categorisations. In addition, the Amadeus database (containing financial information on approximately 8 million public and private companies from 38 European countries) was used to complete data gaps. Employment data was gathered through the Eurostat Task Force's method, based on a more restricted delimitation of the cultural economy. The study also provides sector profiles and case studies to cover specific aspects of the economy of culture which could not be rendered by current official data collection.
- 1.3.3 The study found that the cultural and creative sector across the whole of the EU is growing and developing at a higher pace than the rest of the EU economy, both in terms of output and employment, and can be seen to drive economic and social development and innovation. In 2003, the sector had a turnover of more than €654 billion, contributing to 2.6% of EU GDP. The sector's growth was 12.3% higher than the growth of the general economy. Whereas total employment in the EU decreased in 2002-2004, employment in the cultural and creative sector increased by 1.85%. The study concluded that the sector also serves as a tool for social integration and territorial cohesion, and can contribute to sustainable development and societies.

1.4 UK

- 1.4.1 The report *Staying Ahead: the economic performance of the UK's creative industries* (The Work Foundation, 2007) commissioned by the Department of Culture Media and Sport (DCMS) provides an overview of similar ground at UK level to the European research described above, although without its detailed methodological approach. The study reviews published statistics for the 13 creative industry sectors already defined by DCMS: advertising, architecture, publishing, radio and TV, design, film, music, software and computer services, computer games, designer fashion, crafts, performing arts and the arts and antique market. Although the conceptual framework identified in this report is broadly similar to that of the European Commission research, and to other recent reviews at European and member state level, there are some differences in the specific industrial sectors included within the definitions of cultural and creative industries. Perhaps the most significant of these is the inclusion of the software industry by DCMS and its exclusion (apart from the gaming sector) by the European Commission.
- 1.4.2 The report finds that these creative industries, as defined, account for 7.3% of the UK economy, which is comparable in size to the financial services industry; and that they employ 1 million people directly, while a further 800,000 work in creative occupations. Software (including computer games and electronic publishing), publishing and TV and radio between them accounted for two thirds of overall creative gross value added. The report finds that although the creative

industries have grown on average rather faster than GDP over the last decade, there is considerable volatility around the average, and identifies some signs of difficulties emerging which have begun to constrain this growth.

- 1.4.3 In order for the creative economy to benefit from identifiable global trends, such as the disruption of business models by the emergence of the internet and digitisation, the report concludes that public policy must recognise eight 'drivers' of success: Demand from increasing numbers of sophisticated, educated consumers; Greater diversity, especially cognitive diversity; A level playing field to encourage innovation and experimentation; Education and skills provision to counter shortages in specific areas; Networks to harness capacity for creativity and commercialisation; Public sector provision of fit-for-purpose public architecture, grants and institutions; Intellectual Property regime which is clearly defined and enforceable; and Building greater business capacity.

1.5 Scotland

- 1.5.1 Research by Dunlop et al (2004) aims to estimate the economic impact of the cultural sector in Scotland. It uses an input-output method to derive multipliers of economic activity rather than the production cycle approach used by official bodies such as the EU, DCMS (as above) and Scottish Enterprise. The report begins by discussing which industries should be included within the cultural sector, and derives from Throsby's definition a somewhat narrower range of activities for analysis than the official agencies.
- 1.5.2 Using figures for year 2002/3, and a survey of Scottish arts organisations which receive core funding by the Scottish Arts Council, the report shows that the vast proportion (97.8%) of Scottish Arts Council funding stays in Scotland, supporting local artists and creating activity in industries that supply the arts sector in Scotland. These core funded organisations support a total of 4,026 full-time jobs and £72.5m worth of income in Scotland. The multipliers derived by the study indicate that each job in the arts supports a further 0.83 jobs elsewhere in Scotland and each £1 of income paid to employees in the arts supports a further £0.87 worth of income in other industries in Scotland.

1.6 Public libraries

- 1.6.1 Clayton and Hepworth's 2006 study for the Museums, Libraries and Archives Council (MLA) presents evidence about the contribution of public libraries to the knowledge economy. The study was based on regional surveys of the "economic vitality" related activities of public libraries in the South East, North West, and Yorkshire and Humber regions of England; and six in-depth case studies of library services in Birmingham, Manchester, Slough, Derbyshire, Westminster and West Sussex which used interviews and focus groups.
- 1.6.2 The authors conclude that public libraries are central to the development of what they call the 'community-driven knowledge economy'. They argue that the government needs to balance its national level knowledge economy policies, directed at global competitiveness, with 'community-driven' knowledge economy policies at a local level. Based on the study evidence they conclude that public libraries have a central role in play in this local knowledge economy: with 340 million visits a year (2004-2005), they are the biggest generators of 'customer

capital' in the local public sector. Public libraries contribute to economic development objectives in a range of well established ways: providing a crucial 'bridge' for improving skills and learning especially for 'hard to reach' groups; helping to break down the 'digital divide'; providing business services in the community; acting as 'information hubs' including the provision of consumer information; and helping lever in new investment as partners in town centre redevelopment schemes.

- 1.6.3 The report presents a national framework for gathering evidence of impact and performance while arguing that 'target-setting and objectives should be community-driven and reflect the unique challenges and issues of community knowledge economies.' (2006, 5).

1.7 Economic impact studies

- 1.7.1 Research commissioned by a consortium of public agencies with an interest in the Edinburgh Festivals (SQW Ltd and TNS Travel and Tourism, 2004) confirms the direct economic benefits of these annual cultural events. With statistics and data gathered in the year August 2004 to July 2005, the study uses desk research; surveys of visitors, performers, delegates and journalists; and data collection from Festivals and other relevant organisations (hotels, guesthouses, retailers) in order to identify the profile of festival visitors throughout the year; to assess the additional economic impact generated in Edinburgh, the Lothians and Scotland. The key findings indicate that the Festivals together generate an output of just under £170m in Edinburgh and £184m in Scotland, with £40m in new income in Edinburgh and £51m in Scotland, but the report calls for more investigation on their wider social and cultural impact.
- 1.7.2 Two recent short brochures published by ACE West Midlands focus on arts festivals and classical music respectively, in the West Midlands region of England. Hadley, Whitehouse and Clarke (2005) look at the potential of arts festivals in relation to the regional visitor economy. They conclude, on the basis of a range of data and survey evidence, that the current picture of visitor impact in the region was "pretty impressive" but that there are limitations to the festivals' ability to realise their full potential in terms of attendance, both from the local community and wider afield. The research did not specifically set out to measure the economic impact of visitors to arts festivals, but data collected for the study suggests that visitors to arts festivals have a much higher economic impact than other tourists, even other cultural tourists. The report identifies several critical success factors for festivals as visitor attractions, and proposes some specific shared initiatives between Arts Council England and Culture West Midlands.
- 1.7.3 Research by Audiences Central (2006) looks at the economic impact of classical music in the West Midlands. Applying a straightforward economic impact methodology to data from a survey of 38 venues in 2006, the report estimates these generated total annual economic activity of £67.8 million, on the basis of subsidies totalling £6.8 million from ACE West Midlands together with the local authorities in the region. A companion study uses a similar methodology and finds a similar result for the economic impact of theatre in the same region.

1.7.4 Research by Morris Hargreaves McIntyre (2004) aimed to assess the impact of UK folk festivals on cultural tourism. Using surveys, focus groups and in-depth interviews the report concludes that the UK folk festival sector consists of over 350 festivals, which have a significant and sustainable impact on local economies. An audience of 106,000 people attend an average of 3.3 festivals per year, with each visitor spending £226 per festival. The authors estimate that UK folk festivals generate spending of over £77 million each year. The festivals develop existing, new and non-traditional audiences, and they train, launch and support artists and administrators. However, many festivals do not reach their full potential due to lack in funding, skills, knowledge, support and advice. If these issues were addressed, the authors argue, the impact of folk festivals could be even greater.

1.8 Literature reviews

1.8.1 Landry et al (2004) evaluated the evidence for the contribution of culture (activities, projects and facilities) to social, economic and environmental regeneration. The study, for Culture East Midlands, was intended to benefit cultural organisations working in the area of regeneration and others addressing issues of urban and rural development and regeneration in the East Midlands, although it reviewed wider sources. It found that the body of empirical evidence which demonstrates the contribution of cultural activities to regeneration activities has improved in quality over time, and now goes "well beyond mere boosterism". There is a growing range of methodologies to test out the validity of claims of the value of culture in regeneration, and a substantial number of independent studies which provide defensible evidence. However, the study notes that the evaluation of the effects of culture in regeneration is imperfect and needs to develop beyond isolated case studies to create more comparative long term work.

1.8.2 In a sequence of articles in 2004, 2005 and 2006, Evans and Shaw review and critique the literature on culture and regeneration. Each of these involved a review of literature to date.

1.8.3 The 2004 publication, *Contribution of culture to regeneration in the UK: a review of evidence*, which informed the preparation of a DCMS policy document, also includes data analysis and case studies. This summarises the contribution of culture to regeneration as being evidenced in the literature in the following ways:

- Environmental (physical) regeneration: re-use of redundant buildings; environmental improvements; increased public use of space leading to reduction in vandalism and increased sense of safety; pride in a place; development of living/working and mixed-use space leading to liveability/sustainability; employment of artists on design teams; and incorporation of cultural considerations into future plans.
- Economic regeneration: inward investment (public-private sector leverage); higher resident and visitor spend; job creation (direct, indirect, induced)/wealth creation; employer location/retention; retention of graduates in the area (including artists/creatives); more diverse work force; new business, retail and leisure areas; more public-private-voluntary sector partnerships; more corporate involvement in the local cultural sector; and increased property prices.

- Social regeneration: change in residents' perceptions of their place; greater individual confidence and aspiration; clearer expression of individual and shared ideas and needs; increase in volunteering; increased organisational capacity at local level; increased social capital; change in the image or reputation of a place or group of people; stronger public-private-voluntary sector partnerships; reduced school truancy/offending behaviour; higher educational attainment; new approaches to evaluation, consultation and representation.

1.8.4 The study also identifies gaps in the research evidence, which may exist where evidence is not published or where it is not specifically analysed in cultural terms, but more often because "the rationale for measuring cultural impacts in relation to regeneration is absent or at least not sufficiently understood or valued by stakeholders". In particular it finds that evidence gaps may exist because: culture is not generally recognised in social policy and quality of life indicators (e.g. health, education, employment, crime):

- monitoring and evaluation of regeneration both tend to focus on shorter-term, quantitative outputs (jobs, training, property developed, inward investment, crime etc);
- measuring impacts and evaluating is either the beyond the immediate objectives or not the responsibility of cultural organisations or funders, and there is also valid resistance to over zealous pursuit of scientific objectivity;
- cultural development objectives may conflict with economic and environmental/physical regeneration objectives - for example, there is scepticism over the claims, hype and impacts of flagship regeneration projects on the one hand, and what are seen as instrumental, social policy-oriented, interventionist policies on the other;
- although there is now a wealth of measures, indicators and approaches, there are very few holistic and integrated approaches that can be applied to culture and regeneration - and this surfeit of 'guidance' but dearth of actual application suggests that on the one hand it is too general, and on the other, that resources are not targeted at this aspect of project planning;
- evaluation takes time and costs money – which are not always available.

1.8.5 The study concludes that: cultural programmes can assist with regeneration and economic development processes in communities; however, better evaluation is required, including measurement of cultural impacts; and there is a need for a sample of longitudinal studies.

1.8.6 Evans (2005) reviewed both evidence for the social, economic and environmental impacts attributed to culture-led regeneration, and the indicators used for this purpose. The study observes that this type of regeneration effort is now a feature of cities old and new, as they seek to revive former industrial and waterfront sites and city centres, and establish themselves as competitive cities of culture; while at the same time, the rationale for cultural input to area and neighbourhood regeneration has been extended to include quality of life, as well

- as economic outcomes. The study articulates a hierarchy of types of published reports on culture's contribution to regeneration, some of which are evidence-based, but most of which are not - starting with the most common: 1. Advocacy and promotion; 2. Project assessment; 3. Project evaluation; 4. Programme evaluation; 5. Performance Indicators (PIs); 6. Impact assessment; 7. Longitudinal impact assessments. Where research on the arts and urban regeneration has featured in academic articles, "these tend to be either descriptive and uncritical case studies, or highly critical (but lacking in robust empirical evidence), displaying a 'culture of pessimism'. This is in contrast to both official and media discourses, and the promotional literature which surrounds these major schemes".
- 1.8.7 The study finds that evidence of how far flagship and major cultural projects contribute to a range of regeneration objectives is limited; that measuring the social, economic and environmental impacts attributed to the cultural element in area regeneration is problematic; that the 'evidence' is seldom robust; and that, where it exists, it points to objectives being under-achieved or not sustained. The study concludes with an assessment of how and why gaps in evidence persist, which reiterates the conclusions of Evans 2004. It suggests that a longer view should be taken of culture and regeneration projects and strategies, and the evaluation of their success in both cultural and regeneration terms; and argues that there is a need for a comprehensive evaluation model of a major culture-led regeneration scheme, which would serve as a practical blueprint for others; and recommends a pluralist rather than a standardised approach to evaluation.
- 1.8.8 Building on their earlier work which focused on the UK, this 2006 review by Evans and Shaw of recent international literature explores the art/culture and regeneration nexus across three areas of policy interest: iconic buildings and cities of culture; cultural quarters and clusters; and cultural dynamism. The article includes references from the UK since 2004 and from elsewhere since 2000. The authors suggest that sustainability of positive outcomes will be of growing interest to researchers, policy makers and developers in years to come, as what are currently new projects become established. In the literature reviewed, several researchers have found that sustainability of regeneration activity depends to a great extent on the sense of local ownership and how that is reflected in the use of new buildings and public spaces by a diversity of users. High-profile projects that ignore the historic context of a site and the needs and interests of existing communities (which may be business, or residential, or both) are far less likely to flourish. Similarly, cultural and creative industries quarters that are home to a range of creative businesses and activities are more likely to thrive than those that are more narrowly focused. In terms of the evidence base, the study finds that particular gaps remain in longitudinal research and methods of measuring the social and cultural impact of regeneration programmes that include culture as an integral part of the process.
- 1.8.9 The Arts Council England brochure format publication *The power of art* (2006) presented evidence of the impact of visual arts on three social policy areas: regeneration; health; education and learning. The report gives an overview of current figures from a range of sources including official statistics; and includes twenty case studies detailing the engagement of contemporary artists with communities to achieve a diversity of outcomes.

- 1.8.10 It reports mounting evidence that the visual arts, particularly contemporary practices, have a distinctive and important, but under-realised role in delivering access and social inclusion across society, and can have a positive impact on the people who engage with them. However, while there is qualitative and anecdotal evidence, there is limited robust research evidence of the reach and effects of the visual arts on individuals, communities and localities. The report concludes that there is no common conceptual framework for measuring the impact of the visual arts; that the case studies demonstrate the need to address this gap and to evaluate long-term effects; and makes specific recommendations for actions to improve measurement of impact, ensure collection of robust data, and develop a shared understanding and practice of evaluation.
- 1.8.11 Part 1 of the document presents case studies which illustrate the role of the visual arts in economic and social regeneration, which include benefits such as: reclaiming derelict buildings and land; generating pride in an area; increasing a sense of local ownership of town centres; and development of distinct cultural identity. The document draws mainly on material already in the public domain, and so gains a mention here but not in the other sections.
- 1.8.12 The economic, social and environmental impacts of architecture and design are examined in a literature review commissioned by the Scottish Government (Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, 2006). Looking at the international literature published over a ten year period (1995-2005) the review appraises the research evidence about the positive and negative impacts of the design of both buildings and public spaces, and identifies the related causal factors i.e. the design attributes which contribute to these impacts.
- 1.8.13 Extensive evidence was found for the three types of impact examined, with a wide range of indicators of impact identified. The indicators of economic impact found are summarised below. Evidence of the social and environmental impacts identified is referred to in other sections of this report.
- 1.8.14 The strength of the research evidence for each type of impact was assessed. This showed that over a quarter of the indicators of impact were supported by strong or conclusive evidence, with the majority of indicators supported by suggestive evidence. The review concluded that the body of research in this area lacked a common framework for impact evaluation and tended to be undertaken at an early stage therefore precluding assessment of longer term impacts.
- 1.8.15 Economic impacts:
- Well designed buildings attract investment and create jobs;
 - Good work environments enhance recruitment, retention, satisfaction, motivation, productivity and performance of staff;
 - Landmark renovations or cultural buildings can boost wider regeneration of areas.

1.8.16 Factors identified as contributing to these economic, social and environmental Impacts include: vision or 'wow' factor, restoration/renovation of historic buildings/sites, aesthetic appeal, the environmental context of buildings, sustainable design features, allocation or use of space, comfort, easy navigation, 'character', safe and accessible public realm, mixed use of space, green spaces and trees, the design process, and ease of movement within the local environment.

2 Healthier

2.1 Help people to sustain and improve their health, especially in disadvantaged communities, ensuring better, local and faster access to health care.

- 2.1.1 Arts and health has emerged as a key policy priority over the past few years and consequently a growing body of research has been commissioned in this area.
- 2.1.2 In 2007 Arts Council England (ACE) published its first national strategy for the arts, health and wellbeing, underpinned by a number of pieces of research commissioned in the preceding years. These included a review of the medical literature on arts and health (Staricoff, 2004) and secondary analysis of government data (Windsor, 2005). Also in 2007, ACE in conjunction with the Department of Health published *A Prospectus for arts and health* with the aim of promoting the development of arts activity within the health sector. The prospectus describes itself as "a celebration of the role of arts and health". The publication is essentially a directory of "evidence and good practice examples" whose citations range from project profiles through to academic research. In addition it includes a short section reviewing the evidence base. The publication arose from the recommendations of the Review of Arts and Health Working Group, which was commissioned by the Department of Health. The Review "strongly concluded" that:
- 2.1.3 "the arts are, and should be clearly recognised as, integral to health and health services. The evidence to support this is provided by numerous examples and research. Indeed, the range of activities to which the arts can contribute, including addressing many of the NHS's and society's most pressing priorities, is considerable and impressive." (Arts Council England, 2007, 3)
- 2.1.4 Major pieces of work commissioned recently include a study of the arts, social inclusion and mental health funded by the UK Department for Health and DCMS – reported on below – and a 3 year study of the arts and health, 'Invest to Save', funded by HM Treasury and undertaken by Manchester Metropolitan University.
- 2.1.5 This section concentrates on the relevant literature and systematic reviews published since 2004. The focus of these is on the arts in clinical settings and the role of the arts in mental health and community health. It has not been possible to cover the (mostly) small scale individual medical studies published over the period, which often produce mixed and limited findings. These studies are listed in the Appendix.

Literature reviews

- 2.2.1 Staricoff's 2004 review, published by ACE, covers the medical literature on arts and health published between 1990 and 2004. The review aims to explore the relationship of the arts and humanities to healthcare, and the influence and effects of the arts on health with a view to strengthening existing anecdotal and qualitative information demonstrating the impact that the arts can have on health. It covers the same ground, and supersedes Cooley's 2003 review of the medical literature on arts in health (see below). However it does not look at studies on the

- use of arts interventions in community settings to improve health; and work that is concerned with the first hand engagement of artists with patients and staff in healthcare settings.
- 2.2.2 The review found that there are a number of medical areas in which studies have shown clear and reliable evidence that clinical outcomes have been achieved through the intervention of the arts. These include cancer care, medicine in cardiovascular and intensive care units, in relation to medical procedures, pain management and surgery. There is evidence that arts in mental health care delivers improvements in the communication skills of users and changes in behaviour. The review offers strong evidence of the influence of the arts and humanities in achieving effective approaches to patient management and to the education and training of health practitioners. It identifies the relative contribution of different artforms to the final aim of creating a therapeutic healthcare environment. Studies show that the use of arts can cause positive physiological and psychological changes in clinical outcomes; reduce drug consumption; reduce length of stay in hospital; increase job satisfaction; improve doctor-patient relationships; improve mental healthcare; and develop health practitioners' empathy across gender and cultural diversity.
- 2.2.3 Recommendations for future research include: the effect of the arts and humanities as contributing factors in recruitment and retention of staff; further research on musical instruments in relation to the clinical setting, to optimise the beneficial outcomes of music in healthcare environments; evaluation of the effect of integrating different artforms and humanities into the healthcare culture in issues such as social inclusion and cultural understanding.
- 2.2.4 Cooley's literature review published in 2003 considered material primarily from studies carried out in the UK, the US and Sweden into the contribution of arts and culture to health and well-being. The review concluded that creative arts therapies have been found to contribute to medical treatment. Research has shown that they reduce anxiety and tension in cardiac and surgery patients, reduce pain and discomfort from a wide variety of illnesses, enhance the development of critically ill newborns, increase the speed and completion rate of a variety of medical interventions, help mentally ill individuals remain stable, reduce tension and stress among caregivers and provide better physical surroundings in medical facilities. Investment in arts and culture also produces important social benefits with a strong positive impact on both individual and community health, especially in relation to marginalised groups, youth-at-risk and the elderly.
- 2.2.5 Staricoff (2006) discussed a number of different approaches to the evaluation of implementing arts projects and arts programmes, and their impact in both community settings and healthcare environments. It focuses on the evidence provided by quantitative research, discusses the merits of applying qualitative research, and briefly considers arguments underpinning the introduction of humanities and arts in medical and nursing education and training. The article concludes that evaluations of art projects and programmes in healthcare can provide evidence of the impact of different art forms in encouraging beneficial clinical outcomes in patients, in enhancing the quality of healthcare services and in improving working conditions and job satisfaction.

2.2.6 A systematic review (Evans, 2002) investigated the effectiveness of music as an intervention for hospital patients. The studies all investigated the effect of music, involved adult hospital patients and used a randomized controlled trial design. The studies used outcome measures such as anxiety, satisfaction, pain, mood and vital signs. The review found that music played via headphones reduces anxiety of patients during normal care delivery, but has no impact on the anxiety of patients undergoing more complicated procedures. Music produces a small reduction in respiratory rate during normal care delivery, but appears to have little effect on other vital sign parameters, nor on the vital signs of patients undergoing procedures. Music appears to improve the mood and tolerance of patients, but the evidence for this is limited. The review highlights the need for further research into many aspects of this intervention.

2.2.7 A rapid literature review of arts in adult mental health (White and Angus, 2003) formed part of a macro-review of adult mental health and social exclusion under the auspices of the Social Exclusion Unit in the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister. The review focuses mainly on community-based arts in mental health projects rather than arts projects in psychiatric institutions as these are more likely to address social inclusion issues. Other project reports and relevant academic articles in CAHMH's archive were also drawn upon. The review identified the following issues:

- 1 Research and Evaluation - the evidence base for arts in mental health based on methodical project scrutiny is slim; however, there is contingent evidence that participation in leisure and social connections produce benefits for social inclusion and for mental and physical health.
- 2 Relationship of arts in mental health to medical, health and other services - many projects report that GPs and health centre staff are the least involved, possibly because such projects address aspects of health which are not covered by medical practice.
- 3 Social integration - some work is starting to emerge on the importance of social relationships to health, such as income inequality or the erosion of 'social capital'.
- 4 Arts on prescription - growing connections between arts in mental health and Primary Care Trusts through arts on prescription schemes, which arrange client referrals from GPs or other health workers to local arts organisations.
- 5 Social support and lifelong learning - a common strength of community-based arts in mental health projects is the building of informal social support networks; which can go hand in hand with a semi-formal mentoring approach to stimulate creative activity thus promoting positive mental health.
- 6 Having the right environment - a recurring observation in evaluation of arts in health projects to date is the need for congenial supportive workplaces that elicit full user involvement.
- 7 Training - community artists can work effectively and informally with people with mental health problems, but there is a shortage of artists who are acclimatised to working in an NHS mental health trust environment.

- 2.2.8 Examples of best practice were reviewed through profiles of a wide range of projects, working in different ways and in very different circumstances, but mostly situated in areas of relatively high social deprivation and high unemployment, to develop innovative participatory solutions. However, the limited funding and short term nature of such projects is frequently cited as a major obstacle both to achievement of their aims and to the collection of evidence of their effect.
- 2.2.9 Morris Hargreaves McIntyre (2006) found evidence that within a healthcare context the design attributes of buildings and public spaces can contribute to less illness, faster patient recovery, reduced stress and greater overall health and well-being.

2.3 Evaluations

- 2.3.1 In 2005 the DCMS and the Department of Health jointly commissioned research on the benefits of arts participation for mental health and social inclusion. The study, which was undertaken by a team from the Universities of Anglia Ruskin and Central Lancashire, delivered its final report in September 2007. The output from the first phase of the project (reported in Hacking, Secker et al, 2006) was a review of evaluations of arts and mental health projects in England, conducted via a survey of participatory arts projects for people with mental health needs aged 16 to 65 in England. The study aimed to map the scale and scope of activity, to establish the nature of current approaches to evaluation, to identify appropriate indicators and to develop measures for use in the second phase of the research.
- 2.3.2 The study identified a wide scope of activity, in terms of projects' settings, referral sources, art forms and participation; but concluded that low funding and staffing levels may have implications for the feasibility of routine evaluation in this field. It found that current approaches to evaluation were limited, but entailed considerable effort and ingenuity, suggesting that projects are keen to demonstrate their benefits. The study used the best evaluation practice identified in the survey to develop measures for assessing the mental health, social inclusion and empowerment outcomes of arts participation for people with mental health needs, to be used in the next stage of the project. This user empowerment measure was used in the second phase of research.
- 2.3.3 The main report (Anglia Ruskin/UCLan, 2007) presented the findings of an evaluation which covered 88 participants recruited to a sample of 22 individual arts and mental health projects representative of the sector in England. Nineteen of the 22 projects had taken part in the Phase One survey of arts and mental health activity in England. The projects were spread across the NHS, social, voluntary and cultural sectors and offered a wide range of arts and cultural activities. This was described as 'the first study in the UK involving a substantial sample of arts participants with mental health needs' and therefore offered an opportunity to overcome some of the limitations of the mostly very small scale studies conducted to date in this area. The study used a Theory of Change approach, and involved both quantitative and qualitative methods.

- 2.3.4 Selected psychological scales were used to measure a range of outcomes, identified through a literature review (phase one), project survey, and discussions with experts. Outcomes of improved mental health were measured in terms of increased levels of mental well-being, decreased mental stress, reduced levels of primary and secondary care service use and reduced medication use. Indicators of increased social inclusion were higher levels of social contact likely to build bonding and bridging social capital, reduced levels of perceived stigma and discrimination, and higher levels of engagement in employment and education. Indicators of 'distance travelled' included increased levels of confidence and self-esteem, enjoyment of arts participation, learning/skills gained and pride in work produced.
- 2.3.5 Participants were surveyed using a questionnaire and open questions prior to taking part in the projects and again six months after taking part. 'Significant improvements in empowerment, mental health and social inclusion' were found, and 'these were greater for participants identified as having "clinically significant" mental health problems at baseline'. There was a 'significant decrease in the proportion of participants identified as frequent and regular service users, but there was no change in medication use or use of specific services.' However there was no evidence that any of the decreases were specifically related to arts participation. When the results of the three different types of analyses used in the study were compared, there was found to be very strong evidence that the arts had contributed to empowerment (one of the measures used for 'distance travelled'. However the evidence regarding the contribution of the arts to mental health and social inclusion was found to be 'promising, but less strong'.
- 2.3.6 These quantitative findings were enhanced by qualitative case studies of six very different arts and mental health projects which aimed to understand the processes through which participants gained benefit.
- 1 The following processes were identified as very important in all projects:
 - getting motivated inspired hope and reduced inactivity
 - focusing on art provided relaxation and distraction
 - connecting with others in a supportive environment
 - 2 The following were important at some but not all projects:
 - self expression, which promoted catharsis and self-acceptance
 - connecting with abilities gave a sense of pride and achievement
 - having time out helped alleviate worries
 - 3 The following were important for some participants at all projects:
 - rebuilding identities were associated with increased self-belief, external validation and moving beyond service user identity
 - expanding horizons led to wider aspirations and opportunities and to enhanced self esteem, resulting in reduced social exclusion and improved mental wellbeing.
- 2.3.7 The study makes a number of useful recommendations for future evaluation work, and in particular recommends longer term studies of outcomes to address the question of sustainability. The authors propose that quantitative methods are only useful for assessing the *extent* of any change resulting from arts

participation and that qualitative research is needed to understand *how* and *in what contexts* change occurs.

- 2.3.8 Argyle and Bolton (2005) evaluated a process-based arts in healthcare programme based in an area of disadvantage. The evaluation used a combination of methods, including a literature review; one-to-one interviews with participants, artists and group-leaders; and focus groups. The study aimed to investigate the impact of involvement in arts creation on the mental health and social well-being of participants; and to analyse different forms of arts involvement in health. It concludes that participants find art creation therapeutic and relaxing, while the acquisition of skills and a sense of achievement serve to promote feelings of confidence and self-esteem. Group work strengthens social relationships between members, enhancing a sense of community. The study also identifies a pressing need for effective evaluation and research in this area.

3 Safer and stronger

3.1 Help local communities to flourish, becoming stronger, safer places to live, offering improved opportunities and a better quality of life.

- 3.1.1 The concept of 'social capital' is fundamental to current UK government policy thinking. The contribution of culture to building social capital, and thereby strengthening communities and tackling social exclusion, has become a growing area for cultural research. Much of the work reviewed here has been commissioned by funding departments and agencies seeking evidence of the contribution to social policy objectives.
- 3.1.2 Internationally there is a growing body of research, mostly originating from the US and Canada, which focuses on the development of cultural indicators of community well-being or 'vitality', with a push for these to be included in quality of life frameworks. Of note is the work of the Urban Institute (Jackson et al, 2006), the Centre of Expertise on Culture and Communities (www.cultureandcommunities.ca) and the Social Impact of the Arts Project (Stern and Siefert, 2002). Research by these organisations has helped support an approach in which the vibrancy or 'health' of local cultural activity and the availability of opportunities to take part are accepted as an important aspect of quality of life. Against this background the findings of the Scottish Arts Council's report, *Taking Part*, are relevant to the government's objective of creating 'improved opportunities and better quality of life'. The report found that class, gender, race, and disability are all factors with a bearing on levels of arts attendance and participation, as are the characteristics of the areas in which people live (e.g. urban or rural, suffering multiple deprivation).
- 3.1.3 The emphasis of the government's strategic objective is on social inclusion and the literature reviewed has been selected for this reason. Both social inclusion and social capital are contested terms, defined and interpreted in different ways. The eight publications reviewed here produced conflicting findings, which may be due to this. Authors who have reviewed the evidence conclude that there is currently limited empirical evidence demonstrating how arts and cultural activities contribute to social change at community, neighbourhood or 'group level'. Methodologies for investigating the impacts of arts participation on individuals are relatively under-developed and empirical evidence showing how these individual effects translate at group or community level appears to be scarce. A comprehensive review of the literature about culture, social capital and social inclusion would be instructive.

3.2 Literature reviews

- 3.2.1 Guetzkow (2002) summarises the claims made about the impact of the arts on communities, reviews the evidence, and considers the difficulties involved in attributing causality in this area. Some key theoretical and methodological issues are discussed and a number of problems identified including: aggregation of organizations rather than individuals; case selection bias problems; a lack of studies comparing the arts with other industries; ignoring possible negative externalities of arts; lack of adequate data, especially longitudinal; specification of context effects and intervening factors leading to failures of generalisation. The

- review concludes that, while the impact of the arts on communities is a growing field for research, there remains much to be done to strengthen methodological approaches and the evidence base for policymaking. Recognising the continuing 'gap' in this area Guetzgow poses a number of questions for future research, including comparing community arts programmes that have some kind of political or social goal with those that do not.
- 3.2.2 A report by the Institute for Public Policy Research (Keaney, 2006) reviews the literature and analyses data on social and cultural participation, to explore the contribution that participation in the arts and heritage makes, and could make, to civic life in the UK. The review finds evidence that participatory cultural activity can play an important role in generating social capital and creating civic renewal. Participation can help develop skills and confidence, shape identities and local pride, and increase levels of trust. However, the report concludes that the benefits are not evenly distributed across society, and that cultural participation is marked by a distinct class profile. The study makes a number of recommendations for UK government policy. These include setting government targets for raising participation in community-led cultural activities; adopting a broader government definition of 'cultural' activities; involving local people in planning cultural provision and in distributing Lottery funding; making schools the base for promoting culture in local communities; and increasing the range of 'cultural volunteers', encouraging the young in particular.
- 3.2.3 Burns Owen Partnership (2005) undertook a literature review of the social impact of museums, libraries and archives, focusing on: social inclusion; neighbourhood renewal; community cohesion; cultural diversity; health, particularly mental health; and, regeneration. Policy makers and stake holders were also consulted. The research was commissioned by the MLA and covers the period since 1997.
- 3.2.4 The findings of their meta-review of the evidence are summarised succinctly in the report and are reproduced here: 'The evidence base for social exclusion, neighbourhood renewal and community cohesion is better established than in cultural diversity, health and regeneration. Despite their existence as distinct strands of government policy, these areas (and the evidence relating to them) are often confused and/or taken together. The strongest evidence of social impacts relates to individuals' personal development or the acquisition of so-called 'life skills', specifically through libraries' role in information provision and museums and archives' role in terms of cultural awareness. The evidence for these social impacts overlaps strongly with that for 'learning impacts'.
- 3.2.5 There is much less evidence for group-level social impacts. This is due to a number of factors, both pragmatic - a lack of work on neighbourhood effects in general and a commissioning approach to research that often focuses purely on the effects of specific government programmes - and fundamental: the problem of 'aggregation' in social science and different approaches to defining 'community'. The research that does exist on communities and culture is largely from the US, and predominantly focuses on the arts rather than the museums, libraries and archives domains. It suggests that neighbourhood effects are as important as individual characteristics in determining cultural participation. The main reason that the evidence base suggests, as to why cultural participation is beneficial and something to be encouraged, is that it builds social capital; however, social capital is not all 'good' and there are both theoretical and

empirical criticisms of the validity of the concept, in particular, the degree to which social capital can be differentiated from other forms of capital, principally economic' (2005, 2.1).

- 3.2.6 The authors identify three major weaknesses in the evidence base for museums, libraries and archives: the absence of substantial longitudinal, comparative data on social impact; the lack of an agreed model for describing social impact; and a relative lack of research into social impact related to cultural diversity and health/mental health. In addition their consultation revealed a 'knowledge and understanding gap' between 'those professionals developing programmes which have social impacts, and those policymakers responsible for developing the rationale for government investment.' (2005, i).
- 3.2.7 Morris Hargreaves McIntyre (2006) found evidence that good design can contribute to a number of different types of social impact of benefit to communities. In particular good design can:
- Encourage feelings of wellbeing and pride about who we are and where we live;
 - Foster or inhibit social interaction;
 - Contribute to social cohesion;
 - Increase safety and security and reduce the incidence of accidents;

3.3 Empirical studies

- 3.3.1 Jeannotte (2003) investigates and contributes to the debate about the role of culture in fostering cohesive and sustainable communities. The article examines the key literature on the concepts of social capital (Robert Putnam) and cultural capital (Pierre Bourdieu); and reviews preliminary research evidence on the social impact of the arts, based upon case studies and data taken from the Canadian General Social Survey of 1998.
- 3.3.2 Jeannotte observes that in recent years cultural policy makers have begun to express a stronger interest in the linkages between social and cultural capital. The article focuses on linkages between personal investments in culture and the propensity to volunteer. Jeannotte finds that preliminary case studies and statistical evidence seem to support a feedback loop between cultural capital and civil society/social capital.
- 3.3.3 The article also discusses a preliminary model of how the process of maintaining social cohesion might work. Developed by the Department of Canadian Heritage, it is proposed as an alternative to the prevailing neo-classical economic model that has governed policy development over most of the last two decades. Unlike simple economic models, based on supply and demand and on utility maximization, the social cohesion model is both holistic and reciprocal.
- 3.3.4 The study concludes that personal investments in cultural capital also have collective benefits in raising the social capital of a community, thus making a significant contribution to social cohesion.
- 3.3.5 Scott (2006) tests claims about the social impact and value of museums

embodied in public policy thinking against the views of both museum professionals and the general public, i.e. from the perspective of the sector's 'heart and purpose of the museum sector' as well as a 'public value' perspective. The professional cohort included directors and senior staff of national, state, local and specialist museums throughout Australia, academics, consultants and service providers. The public cohort comprised visitors and non visitors to museums across a range of geographic areas and population demographics. A methodology known as Delphi was used, a technique which enables individuals who are geographically distant to share and exchange knowledge and opinions without meeting and to arrive at a consensus. It was implemented via an email survey comprising three rounds of questions related to the value and impact of museums, the responses were synthesised at each stage, and finally subjected to detailed analysis.

- 3.3.6 Posing different types of questions, opinions were sought on the short and long term impacts of museums on individuals and communities: personal, social and economic. Regarding the impact on individuals, a significant level of agreement was found between the two groups and of connection between intermediate outcomes and longer term impacts. The public cohort attached greater importance to the role of museums as leisure attractions while professionals attached more importance than the public to the role of museums in social inclusion. The professional cohort was asked to justify its opinions and think of evidence to support them, generating 'qualitative and quantitative evidence for 20 of the individual, social and economic outcome and impact claims'.
- 3.3.7 The study demonstrates a high level of consensus on the types of impact museums are considered to have, particularly amongst professionals (although the author did not reflect on the possible reasons for this) and generated a range of types of evidence to support these (although these mostly take the form of outputs). Significantly, the study found that some of the ways the public value museums were not mentioned by the professionals. From a public perspective the important impacts of museums were found to be 'intangibles': 'the personal learning in a visual, hands-on, free-choice environment, the development of perspective and insight and the important experience of linking with the past.' The public valued the latter for encouraging a 'sense of belonging', a 'sense of progress', and a sense of perspective on one's place in the world – all important from a community perspective.

3.4 Evaluation

- 3.4.1 In a report for Arts Council England, Jermyn (2004) builds on her earlier literature review on the contribution of the arts to social inclusion (Jermyn, 2001), with evidence drawn from case studies of community arts projects. The study uses an extensive range of methods including a literature review; case studies; interviews; observation; data analysis; and questionnaires. An assessment was made of the impact of the arts by analysing three broad models of arts intervention: community-led work; experienced arts organisations working with socially excluded groups; and experienced arts organisations working alongside less experienced, usually much larger, arts organisations to share their skills in this area.
- 3.4.2 The study found evidence of confusion and discomfort amongst arts practitioners

around use of terms like 'social inclusion/social exclusion'. It identifies principles of good practice in delivering 'social inclusion work' projects; challenges of partnership working and sustainability; and some indicators of how to measure success in such projects.

- 3.4.3 A recent evaluation (Jermyn, 2006) assesses the impact of six dance projects funded by ACE to promote social inclusion in various ways. The conclusions support the findings of Jermyn's 2004 study (see above). The initial evaluations suggest that participants in dance activities can benefit from the experience and this is supported by qualitative evidence. Overall outcomes include positive effects on: dance skills, knowledge and appreciation of dance; confidence, pride and self-esteem; physical health and well-being; trust and team-work. However, it cannot be concluded that all participants received the same benefits, nor that benefits were long-lasting, as participants' development was not evaluated after the duration of the projects.
- 3.4.4 Research by Aylward in 2006 for the National Association of Youth Theatres, the development agency for youth theatre practice in England, examined the impact of youth theatres on their communities. The survey involved postal questionnaires sent to all youth theatre projects in England listed in the NAYT database, as well as to local authorities and a range of voluntary and community sector organisations with an interest in youth theatre; follow up in-depth interviews; and five case studies.
- 3.4.5 The survey found evidence that participation in youth theatre has a positive and wide-ranging impact on the communities where the theatres are located. Benefits include: the breaking down of barriers between different social groups and the formation of positive relationships; greater awareness and involvement of young people in local issues and active citizenship, culminating in an overall increased sense of community; changed perceptions about young people and the contribution they can make to their local communities; and the improved profile and reputation of a local community.

4 Smarter

4.1 Expand opportunities for Scots to succeed from nurture through to life long learning ensuring higher and more widely shared achievements.

4.1.1 Evidence of the effects of arts participation on educational attainment and future employability has previously been identified as a key gap (Ruiz, 2004) and as a result this has been a priority area for commissioned research over the past few years. This section focuses on the findings of some major reports and consequently is unable to cover some 17 individual empirical studies identified, most of which looked at the effects of arts interventions on school age children. Details of these are given in the Appendix. There is much academic research activity in this area and a meta-review of studies in this area would be more productive than commissioning new studies.

4.1.2 Recent evaluation work provides strong evidence that the arts produce what are often termed 'intermediate outcomes' i.e. benefits for children and young people that make the achievement of longer term outcomes like improved educational attainment and employability, more (rather than less) likely. These benefits relate to personal development (for example, improved self esteem, self confidence, social skills, awareness of others) and affective outcomes (e.g. enjoyment, pride, sense of achievement). For some, but not all, pupils a significant improvement in key skills including literacy, numeracy and ICT has been attributed to the arts. Small, but statistically significant, improvements in educational attainment have also been reported.

4.1.3 In a different area of education, within the criminal justice field, evaluation of the arts as a medium for offender rehabilitation has identified similar types of positive effects, which vary for different individuals. The culture of arts interventions and their physical context were found to be key contributory factors. However longer term research is needed to investigate whether these 'indicators of change' play a role in any significant life changes later on.

4.2 Research commissioned or sponsored by UK government and agencies

4.2.1 A report by Kinder and Harland in 2004 reviewed some key findings from two of the National Foundation for Education Research's (NFER) major research areas: strategies to address pupil disaffection, and arts education, focusing on overlap and commonality in reported effects and also effective practice. The study addresses as central questions whether, how and why arts education might make a contribution to those strategies aimed at addressing (or preventing) young people's disengagement from learning and educational opportunity.

4.2.2 Having uncovered links between the two areas of research, the study identifies some policy and practice issues to be tackled within English schools to both raise the quality of arts education and also to help young people to re-engage with learning are highlighted. These include: status of arts subject within the national curriculum; adequate provision of the arts and key stages 2 and 4; enjoyment and perceived relevance of the arts; internal and external support for the arts and arts teachers; specialist arts teachers; a praise culture; practical task-based activities; performance, display, evaluation and symbolic 'celebration' of what is

- produced; pupils' own contribution.
- 4.2.3 In a report published by NFER, Harland et al (2005) assess the Arts-Education Interface (AEI) initiative, which was launched in 2001 by the then Arts Council of England and the Regional Arts Boards. This initiative explored the relationship between the arts and education through a programme of arts-based interventions organised within the Education Action Zones (EAZs) of Bristol and Corby. The research aims were to: examine the outcomes of different interventions on pupils and young people, teachers, schools, artists and arts organisations; explore the factors that affect the range and quality of those effects; and, draw out any general lessons for developing effective practices.
- 4.2.4 The study researched 15 interventions, which took place during the academic years 2001-02 and 2002-03. The sample included a cross-section of schooling phases, different educational sectors and a range of art forms. Partnerships between the arts and education communities were initiated by locally based AEI Arts Council coordinators. The research followed the progress of five one-off interventions, four multiple art form series interventions and three developmental single art form interventions - all of which had a focus on the pupils' or young people's learning. The remaining three interventions concentrated on the professional development of teachers. For each intervention, the fieldwork comprised the collection of data in three phases: baseline (prior to the intervention taking place), intervention and immediate impact (during or immediately after), and follow-up (longer term). Data was collected through a range of techniques, including one-to-one interviews, questionnaires and observations. Pupils, teachers, head teachers, artists, arts organisation directors and EAZ and Arts Council staff were interviewed.
- 4.2.5 The research identifies eleven broad categories of effects for pupils and young people. Those most frequently reported and given particular emphasis are: affective outcomes such as enjoyment, pride and a sense of achievement; art form knowledge, appreciation, skills and techniques; personal development, especially self-esteem and self-confidence; social development, particularly teamwork, and awareness of others.
- 4.2.6 Eames et al (2006) is the final report of the evaluation of Creative Partnerships, which looks at the impact on educational achievement. The research, published by NFER, examines the relationship between participation in activities of the Creative Partnerships programme and progress made by young people in their school examinations; and aims to identify initial indicators of impact of Creative Partnerships. A multilevel modelling statistical analysis was applied to data on pupils collected through primary and secondary schools and the National Pupil Database. Pupils were identified who had participated in the programme during two academic years (2002/3 and 2003/4). 398 schools involved in Creative Partnerships since the launch of the programme (all located in disadvantaged areas) were studied.
- 4.2.7 The research concludes that young people who participated in Creative Partnerships activities made either similar or slightly better progress in their national curriculum assessments than similar young people nationally (who did not participate); and those known to have attended Creative Partnerships activities out performed other pupils in the same schools by a small but

statistically significant extent.

- 4.2.8 The Office for Standards in Education (Ofsted) in 2006 published an evaluation of Creative Partnerships, which looks at the impact of taking part on learners. The research evaluated the effectiveness of Creative Partnerships phase 1 initiatives in six areas of the UK using a range of methods: surveys; observation of lessons and planning activities; interviews with teaching staff, creative practitioners, pupils and parents; analysis of pupil's work.
- 4.2.9 The evaluation found that involvement in the programme helped pupils to develop good personal and social skills, while for many there was also significant improvement on key skills such as literacy, numeracy and ICT. Most programmes were effective in developing creative attributes and stimulating pupil's creativity, although pupils were often unclear about how to apply these qualities independently to develop original ideas and outcomes. However, a basis for the further development of the pupil's creative skills had been established.
- 4.2.10 Marsh et al (2006) *Arts and Employability* is a commissioned piece of secondary analysis of government data, which has produced findings on the effect of studying arts subjects on labour market outcomes. The link between studying arts subjects at school and later employability was investigated through data matching, using the Scottish School Leavers Survey (SSLS) and the Scottish Qualification Authority (SQA) datasets.
- 4.2.11 The analysis concludes that labour market outcomes and employability of young people who leave school at the earliest opportunity appear to be improved by studying arts subjects at school. Young people who study arts are more likely to maintain employment, work in crafts and related jobs and are overall no less likely to work in highly skilled jobs compared to other young people who did not study arts and who left school in the same year. Results show a clear link between studying drama and music and high levels of confidence. Arts students overall are expected to have lower levels of confidence as they are more likely to come from lower socio-economic backgrounds. However, young people from lower socio-economic backgrounds gaining confidence at school, as demonstrated by drama or music students, are more likely to enjoy higher salaries and enter professional or managerial jobs.
- 4.2.12 *Retuning, the evaluation of Scotland's Youth Music Initiative 2003-2006* (Scottish Arts Council, 2007) carried out by the Centre for Public Policy at Northumbria University, investigated as one part of its remit, the impact on children and young people of taking part in music. The Youth Music Initiative is a major government investment (£37.5m) in music provision for young people, extending access to music tuition and music making throughout Scotland. Launched in 2003, it has now been extended until 2008. Because of the nature of the evaluation the focus was on short term, rather than on long term impact, explored through interviews and surveys with parents, teachers, music instructors and informal sector providers, and through face-to-face research with groups of young people.
- 4.2.13 The evaluation found clear evidence of short-term personal, social and educational benefits. The report noted: "In particular, parents and teachers

perceive that the YMI has led to children gaining musical skills and appreciation, improved concentration and group working skills. Key skills such as numeracy and motor skills have been incorporated into music tuition; improvements in behaviour, confidence and also self-esteem were also noted.” (Scottish Arts Council, 2006 b, 4). The research team found evidence that some groups gained particularly from the initiative. These include pupils with special educational needs or with learning difficulties, less well-behaved pupils and those who do not do well in other subject areas.

- 4.2.14 A study by Miles and Clarke (2006) investigates the feasibility of researching the impact of arts interventions in criminal justice settings. Commissioned by the DCMS, Arts Council England and the Department for Education and Skills (Offender Learning and Skills Unit) it pilots a range of research methods with the aim of improving the evidence base for the arts in offender rehabilitation. The evaluation involved five different arts projects in custodial settings and trialled six data gathering methods: profiling, psychometrics, observation, interviews, diaries and tracking.
- 4.2.15 The evaluation found evidence that arts participation produces positive changes in ‘engagement, self-esteem, confidence, self-control and the ability to co-operate’ and concludes that ‘arts interventions in prisons and resettlement are particularly good at fostering the kinds of personal and social resources that open avenues to further learning and underpin attitudinal and behavioural change.’ A wide range of contextual factors were found to influence both the extent and the ways in which participation affects individuals. The findings suggest that arts activities ‘may benefit vulnerable individuals in particular, and that they (arts activities) may be better at dealing with some issues (such as self-harm) than others.’

4.3 Literature reviews

- 4.3.1 Deasy (2002) provides a research compendium on the role of arts learning in assisting the development of critical academic and social skills. The document comprises summaries and reviews of 62 studies in the fields of dance, drama, music, visual arts and multi-arts; plus 5 essays on the implications of the total body of work in each area. Deasy's literature review is the basis for *Critical evidence* (Ruppert, 2006) which aims to describe (in non-technical terms) what current research says about the social and academic benefits associated with students' arts learning experiences. The key findings in the literature are that learning experiences in the arts contribute to: academic skills (reading and language; mathematics); basic skills (cognitive, social and motivational); and comprehensive skills (creation of a positive school environment).
- 4.3.2 Morris Hargreaves McIntyre (2006) identifies evidence that the design attributes of schools can both positively and negatively influence pupil motivation and performance.

5 Greener

5.1 Improve Scotland's natural and built environment and the sustainable use and enjoyment of it.

- 5.1.1 Published research on culture and the natural environment is scarce. There is some emerging academic interest in this subject amongst geographers, represented here by Morris and Cant's 2004 study of a woodland sculpture trail which suggests this as a promising subject for further research.
- 5.1.2 Most of the published work related to this strategic objective is concerned with the role of culture on the built environment. The main focus is on the physical regeneration of areas, a key intersect between creative industries, regeneration, cultural and urban policy on which there is an extensive academic literature. This section focuses on a review of the literature on architecture and design (Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, 2006) and publications by Evans and Shaw (2004), and Montgomery (2004) which provide an overview of both positive and negative evidence about culture and physical regeneration. Reference is made to the academic debate about this and culture-led regeneration more widely. In addition Landry et al (2004), cited in section one, include examples of evidence relating to environmental regeneration and these are referred to below.

5.2 Empirical studies

- 5.2.1 Morris and Cant (2004) is a rare example of research into the impact of culture on people's interaction with the natural environment. The authors note the 'increasing recognition that green spaces play an important role within society, not only in promoting health and well-being, but also in increasing social inclusion and community engagement with local natural environments.' The focus of the study was the Hebden Bridge Sculpture Trail, an annual temporary site-specific outdoor sculpture exhibition held in a woodland area in West Yorkshire. It looked at the making, installation and reception of the sculpture during the 2004 trail using a range of methods including interviews, focus groups, workshops and the provision of disposable cameras to visitors for use in exploring the trail.
- 5.2.2 While other studies have looked at the effects on audience reception of displaying artwork out-with conventional exhibition spaces this study also considered the effects of the artwork on visitors' reception of the environment. The authors report that parents perceived the woodland as a safer place for children and that many regular visitors to the woods saw the familiar landscape with 'sharpened eyes', the sculptures drawing their attention to features usually overlooked. The authors conclude that:
- 'involving them (local people) in the creation of sculpture has the potential to increase interest in, and create a sense of ownership of, pride for, and connection with, that environment.
 - experiencing art in the natural environment heightens and stimulates the senses in a manner impossible in an art gallery, and encourages people to (re)discover their local greenspaces.'

5.3 Literature reviews

5.3.1 Reviews by both Evans and Shaw's (2004) and Landry et al (2004) have appraised the evidence about culture and environmental regeneration, drawing very similar conclusions. Evans and Shaw identified evidence that culture contributes to environmental (physical) regeneration in the following ways: (2004:9)

- re-use of redundant buildings
- environmental improvements
- increased public use of space leading to reduction in vandalism and an increased sense of safety
- pride in a place
- development of live/work and mixed use space (sustainable development/liveability, 'compact city' - high density, low environmental impacts, egg transport/traffic)
- the employment of artists on design teams
- the incorporation of cultural considerations into future plans

5.3.2 These have been achieved through a number of means, including the reclaiming or redevelopment of redundant spaces or buildings, often former industrial buildings; the building of new landmark cultural facilities in regeneration areas; the commissioning of public art or involvement of artists in regeneration schemes and the development of 'creative clusters' or 'cultural quarters'.

5.3.3 In addition to these better known developments, Evans and Shaw discuss transport, and cite a range of examples in which the use of art, and involvement of artists in transport design, has helped to encourage public transport use by making it more attractive (including feeling safer) as well as more efficient. Evaluations have identified a synergy when public transport and cultural development are integrated.

5.3.4 Seven of the case studies presented in the report provided illustrations of these physical impacts (2004, 33). These include the Custard Factory in Birmingham, Nottingham's Lace Market, and Acme Studios in London.

5.3.5 However Evans and Shaw point to other evidence that the contribution of culture may not always be positive 'or at least, sustainable' (2004,17). A now familiar downside of otherwise apparently successful regeneration initiatives in cities around the world has been rising property prices/rental costs and the displacement of original residents and businesses through gentrification. Problems have also been experienced in some "24-hour city" developments for example, conflicts of interest arise between residents and local businesses, and the exclusion of many social and age-groups deterred by anti-social behaviour and safety fears in city centre areas.

5.3.6 Landry et al (2004) evaluated the evidence about culture and regeneration and concluded that despite many gaps in the evidence, there still exists 'a substantial and diverse body of evidence that a wide range of cultural activities positively add value to regeneration initiatives' (2004,35). In addition to the contribution to physical renewal, covered above, they identified other ways in which culture contributes to environmental objectives:

1. Improving environmental quality:
 - By encouraging more people to use and enjoy open space (through public art)
 - By reducing traffic and fear of crime, and by creating safe play areas (through involving local people and artists in the design of environmental improvements)
2. Improving quality in architecture and urban design
 - research has shown the benefits of investing in high quality design
3. Energy efficiency and human settlements
 - By encouraging people to walk, cycle or use public transport (through the use of public art in streets and in underground systems to improve the attractiveness of surroundings and to reduce vandalism)
 - By encouraging the use of renewable materials (by example, through their use in arts projects)

5.3.7 These findings are confirmed by Morris Hargreaves McIntyre (2006). Their review of the international literature on the impacts of architecture and design found evidence that sustainable design features can:

- Reduce energy use and carbon emissions of new buildings;
- Minimise traffic generation and car use, reducing pollution
- Reduce traffic accidents and encourage walking and cycling
- Provide natural habitat to encourage wildlife.

5.4 Evaluation

5.4.1 Montgomery (2004) considered the arguments for what makes a successful cultural quarter and appraised these against the evidence from cultural quarters in the UK (Sheffield Cultural Industries Quarter, Manchester Northern Quarter), Ireland (Temple Bar, Dublin) and Australia (Hindley Street, Adelaide). While there exists considerable variation between the four areas, all four were found to have generated improvements in the physical street environment and in general street life. By attracting a good mix of new businesses and residents to the areas the quarters had to varying degrees succeeded in bringing new life to inner urban areas. Montgomery concludes there is "compelling evidence" that culturally led urban regeneration works, but that the extent to which it works depends on the quality of strategic planning and policy interventions (2004, 29). This is critical if the potential negative impacts identified in the literature are to be avoided.

6 Conclusions

- 6.1 The publications reviewed in this brief and selective literature scan add to what is now a strong body of evidence for the contribution of arts and culture to three of the five strategic objectives of the Scottish Government: 1, Wealthier, 2, Healthier and 4, Smarter.
- 6.2 The findings of some studies support the contribution of arts and culture to strategic objective 3, Safer and Stronger, but the sample of literature reviewed indicates conflicting evidence about the community-level impact of arts and culture, specifically in relation to social capital and social inclusion.
- 6.3 In relation to strategic objective 5, Greener, there is strong evidence, both positive and negative, about the impact of culture-led regeneration and of architecture and design on the built environment, but little available research evidence relating to the natural environment.
- 6.4 Many of the pieces of commissioned work reviewed here, and other work not included, have been about assessing the difficulties in developing evidence of impact and looking at ways to overcome these, including the piloting of methodologies and research approaches (Evans and Shaw, 2004, Oakley, 2004, Anglia Ruskin/UCLAN Research Team, 2005, 2006a, b; Miles and Clarke, 2006). This work has moved things on quite significantly, helping the evidence base to catch up with policy.
- 6.5 In terms of improving the research evidence for the impact of arts and culture overall a consistent theme in the literature reviewed is the need for a longer term approach to evaluating cultural interventions. Authors writing across a range of contexts urge the need for larger scale, longer term studies in order to investigate long term impact, and the question of sustainability. Thus one of the main conclusions of Ruiz' 2004 literature review remains relevant three years on.
- 6.6 The table below gives an overview of the continuing evidence gaps cited in the literature reviewed:

Objective	Gaps
1. Wealthier and fairer	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="632 1538 1353 1597">– how the wealth created by Scotland's creative sector is shared; <li data-bbox="632 1606 1353 1704">– a comprehensive evaluation model for large scale culture-led regeneration programmes involving, for example, major events and flagship cultural venues; <li data-bbox="632 1713 1034 1742">– the sustainability of impacts <li data-bbox="632 1751 1353 1850">– the evaluation of cultural impacts (rarely considered) and how these interact with social and economic impacts. <li data-bbox="632 1859 1295 1917">– Longitudinal comparative research of culture led regeneration initiatives; <li data-bbox="632 1921 1182 1930">– The effects of visual arts on individuals,

	communities, localities
2. Healthier	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - impact on health in community settings (i.e. non-clinical settings) - a longitudinal study with a large sample investigating the impact of the arts on mental health and well-being, particularly the issue of sustainability - further research on music and musical instruments in relation to the clinical setting - the effect of integrating different artforms into the healthcare culture with respect to social inclusion and cultural diversity - arts and humanities as a contributory factor in recruiting and training staff in the health sector
3. Safer and stronger	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - social impact at a group or neighbourhood, rather than individual level - role of arts in cultural diversity, community health and community regeneration <p><i>Museums, libraries archives:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - lack of longitudinal, comparative data on social impact - lack of an agreed conceptual model for describing impact - relative lack of research into social impact on cultural diversity, health and mental health.
4. Greener	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - impact of arts and cultural activity on the natural environment and sustainability, including public transport - holistic integrated approaches to evaluating flagship major cultural projects, including cultural buildings/venues, sensitive to the relationships between cultural, economic and social impacts, both positive and negative - evaluations of the long-term environmental, social and economic impact of architecture and design - a common evaluation framework for architecture and design initiatives.

Bibliography

Introduction

Ruiz, Janet, *A literature review of the evidence base for culture, the arts and sports policy*, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive (2004)

1 - Wealthier and fairer

Audiences Central, *Economic impact of classical music in the West Midlands. Research Report*, Online: Arts Council England West Midlands (2006)

Clayton, Naomi and Hepworth, Mark, *Public libraries in the knowledge economy. Report for the Museums, Libraries and Archives Council*. London: The Local Futures Group (2006)

Dunlop, Stewart et al, *Economic impact of the cultural sector in Scotland*, Stirling: Scotecon (2004.)

Evans, Graeme and Shaw, Phyllida, *The contribution of culture to regeneration in the UK: a review of the evidence*, London: DCMS, (2004)

Evans, Graeme, *Measure for measure: evaluating the evidence of culture's contribution to regeneration*, *Urban Studies*, 42(5-6): 959-983 (2005)

Evans, Graeme and Shaw, Phyllida, *Literature review: culture and regeneration*, *Arts Research Digest* 37 (2006)

Hadley, Richard, Whitehouse, Paula and Clarke, Mary, *Arts festivals and the visitor economy. Their contribution and their potential in the West Midlands region*, London and Online: Arts Council England (2006)

KEA European Affairs, *The economy of culture in Europe*. Brussels: European Commission (2006)

Landry, Charles, Bianchini, Franco, Henry, Ian and Brookes, Fred, *Culture and regeneration: an evaluation of the evidence*, Online: Culture East Midlands (2004)

Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, *The impact of folk festivals. Final report*. Online: The Association of Festival Organisers (2004)

Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, *A literature review of the social, economic and environmental impact of architecture and design*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive (2006).

Prevista and Arts Council England, *The power of art: visual art: evidence of impact*, London: Arts Council England (2006)

SQW Ltd and TNS Travel and Tourism, *Edinburgh festivals 2004-2005 economic impact survey. Final report*, Online: City of Edinburgh Council, Scottish Enterprise Edinburgh and Lothian, VisitScotland, EventScotland (2005)

The Work Foundation, *Staying ahead: the economic performance of the UK's creative industries*, London: Department for Culture Media and Sport (2007)

2 - Healthier

The Anglia Ruskin/UCLan Research Team, *Mental health, social inclusion and the arts. Developing the evidence base. Final Report*, London: Department for Culture, Media and Sport/ Department of Health, (2007)

The Anglia Ruskin/UCLan Research Team, *Mental health, social inclusion and the arts: developing the evidence base. Second interim report from Phase 2: Baseline results*, Online: National Social Inclusion Programme (2006a)

The Anglia Ruskin/UCLan Research Team, *Mental health, social inclusion and the arts: developing the evidence base. Second interim report from Phase 2: Baseline results*, Online: National Social Inclusion Programme (2006)

Arts Council England, *A prospectus for arts and health*, London: Arts Council England, (2007)

Arts Council England, *The arts, health and wellbeing*, London: Arts Council England, (2007)

Argyle, Elaine and Bolton, Gillie, *Art in the community for potentially vulnerable mental health groups*, Health Education 105(5): 340-354. (2005)

Cooley, Nancy J., *Arts and culture in medicine and health: a survey research paper*, Online: British Columbia Arts Council, (2003)

Evans, David, *The effectiveness of music as an intervention for hospital patients: a systematic review*. Journal of advanced nursing 37(1): 8-18. (2002)

Hacking, Sue, Secker, Jenny, Kent, Lyn, Shenton, Jo, Spandler, Helen, *Mental health and arts participation: the state of the art in England*. The Journal of the Royal Society for the Promotion of Health, 126(3): 121-127. (2006)

Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, *A literature review of the social, economic and environmental impact of architecture and design*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive (2006).

Staricoff, Rosalia Lechuk, *Arts in health: the value of evaluation*, The Journal of the Royal Society for the Promotion of Health 126(3) (2006)

Staricoff, Rosalia Lechuk, *Arts in health: a review of the medical literature. Research report 36*, London: Arts Council England (2004)

White, Mike and Angus, John, *Arts and adult mental health literature review. Addressing the evidence base from participation in arts and cultural activities*, Durham: Centre for Arts and Humanities in Health and Medicine (2003)

Windsor, Joy, *Your health and the arts: a study of the association between arts engagement and health. Supplement to Research Report 37*, London: Arts Council

England (2005)

3 - Safer and stronger

Aylward, Nicola, *Impact of youth theatres on communities*, Darlington: National Association of Youth Theatres (2005)

Burns Owen Partnership, *New directions in social policy: developing the evidence base for museums, libraries and archives in England*, London: Museums, Libraries and Archives Council, 2005.

Guetzkow, Joshua, *How the arts impact communities: an introduction to the literature on arts impact studies. Working Paper Series, 20*, Online: Princeton University (2002)

Keaney, Emily, *Culture, community & civil renewal*, London: Institute for Public Policy Research (2006)

Jackson, Maria-Rosario, Kabwasa-Green, Florence, Herranz Jr, Joaquin, *Cultural vitality in communities: interpretation and indicators*. Washington DC: The Urban Institute (2006)

Jeannotte, Sharon M., *Singing alone? The contribution of cultural capital to social cohesion and sustainable communities*, International Journal of Cultural Policy, 9(1), 35-49, (2003)

Jermyn, Helen, *Dance included: dance in social exclusion contexts*, London: Arts Council England (2006)

Jermyn, Helen, *The art of inclusion. Research Report 35*. London: Arts Council England, (2004)

Jermyn, Helen, *Arts and social exclusion: a review prepared for the Arts Council of England*, London: Arts Council of England, (2001)

Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, *A literature review of the social, economic and environmental impact of architecture and design*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive (2006).

Scott, Carol, *Museums: Impact and Value*, Cultural Trends 15: 1, 45-75 (2006)

Scottish Arts Council, *Taking Part. Arts attendance, participation and attitudes in Scotland 2006*, Edinburgh: Scottish Arts Council, (2006)

Shaw, Phyllida, *Regeneration, community facilitation and social inclusion: the role of cultural activity. Report to Government Office of Yorkshire and the Humber and to Yorkshire Culture*, Online: Yorkshire Culture, (2003)

Stern, Mark J., Seifert, Susan C., *Culture builds community evaluation. Summary report*, Online: University of Pennsylvania, (2002)

4 - Smarter

Deasy, Richard J., *Critical links: learning in the arts and student academic and social development*, Washington DC: Arts Education Partnership, (2002)

Eames, Anna, Benton, Tom, Sharp, Caroline and Kendall, Lesley, *The impact of creative partnerships on the attainment of young people. Final report.*, Slough: National Foundation for Educational Research, (2006)

Harland, John, Lord, Pippa, Stott, Alison, Kinder, Kay, Lamont, Emily, Ashworth, Mary, *The Arts-Education Interface: a mutual learning triangle?* Slough: National Foundation for Educational Research, (2005)

Kinder, Kay and Harland, John, *Arts and social inclusion: what's the evidence?* British Journal of Learning Support 19 (1): 52-56 (2004)

Marsh, Richard, Mosca, Irene, Zuleeg, Fabian & DTZ Consulting & Research, *Arts and employability*, Online: Scottish Executive, 2006. Available at <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2006/12/11103311/0>

Miles, Andrew and Clarke, Rebecca, *The arts in criminal justice. A study of research feasibility*. Manchester: Centre for Research in Socio Cultural Change, University of Manchester (2006)

Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, *A literature review of the social, economic and environmental impact of architecture and design*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive (2006).

Office for Standards in Education, *Creative Partnerships: initiative and impact. The impact of sustained partnerships between schools and creative practitioners as a result of Creative Partnerships initiatives*, Online: Office for Standards in Education, (2006)

Ruppert, Sandra S., *Critical evidence: how the arts benefit student achievements*, Washington DC: National Assembly of State Arts Agencies/Arts Education Partnership (2006)

Scottish Arts Council, *retuning. Evaluation of Scotland's Youth Music Initiative (2003-2006)*. Edinburgh: Scottish Arts Council (2007a)

Scottish Arts Council, *retuning. Youth Music Initiative Evaluation Summary Report 2003-2006*. Edinburgh: Scottish Arts Council (2007b)

5 - Greener

Evans, Graeme and Shaw, Phyllida, *Literature review: culture and regeneration*, Arts Research Digest 37 (2006)

Landry, Charles, Bianchini, Franco, Henry, Ian, Brookes, Fred, *Culture and regeneration: an evaluation of the evidence*, Online: Culture East Midlands, (2004)

Montgomery, John, *Cultural quarters as mechanisms for urban regeneration. Part 2: A review of four cultural quarters in the UK, Ireland and Australia*, Planning, Practice & Research, 19:1, 3-31 (2004)

Morris, N. J. and Cant, S. G. *The Hebden Bridge Sculpture Trail: can a collaborative and community arts event stimulate new understandings of landscape, place and identity?* Conference proceedings, OPENspace/Peoplespace Conference, Edinburgh (2004)
<http://www.openspace.eca.ac.uk/conference/proceedings/start.htm>

Morris Hargreaves McIntyre, *A literature review of the social, economic and environmental impact of architecture and design*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive (2006).

Conclusions

Galloway, Susan, Birkin, Nicola, Petticrew, Mark, Hamilton, Christine and Bell, David, *Quality of life and well-being: measuring the benefits of culture and sport. A literature review*. Online: Scottish Executive, (2006)

Miles, Andrew and Clarke, Rebecca, *The arts in criminal justice. A study of research feasibility*, Manchester: Centre for Research on Socio Economic Change, University of Manchester (2006)

Oakley, Kate, *Developing the evidence base for support of cultural and creative activities in South East England*, Online: South East England Cultural Consortium (2004)

APPENDIX: ADDITIONAL REFERENCES

Listed here are studies relevant to the five objectives, but which could not be included in the main report. For brief details of the objectives, findings and methodology please refer to the Impact Database (<http://www.gla.ac.uk/ccpr/>)

HEALTHIER

Bundy, Penny, *Using drama in the counselling process: the Moving On project*, *Research in Drama Education*, 11:1 (2006) - documents the use of drama as therapy for survivors of abuse.

Higgins, Maria, McKevitt, Christopher, Wolfe, Charles D.A., *Reading to stroke unit patients: perceived impact and potential of an innovative arts based therapy*, *Disability and rehabilitation* 27(22): 1391-1398 (2005) - a study of reading as part of the rehabilitation of stroke patients.

Parr, Hester, *Mental health, the arts and belongings*, *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 31(2): 150-166. (2006) – review of an arts in mental health project.

Reynolds, Frances and Lim, Kee Hean, *Contribution of visual art-making to the subjective well-being of women living with cancer: a qualitative study*, *The Arts in Psychotherapy* 34: 1-10 (2007) - a study of the wellbeing effects of participation in visual arts on for women with cancer.

Gussak, David, *Effects of art therapy with prison inmates: a follow-up study*, *The Arts in Psychotherapy* 33(3): 188-198, (2006) - looks at the effects on prison inmates of art therapy with respect to experience of depression and improvements in social skills.

Wilson, Cathy and Goldie, Isabella, *Arts, creativity and mental health initiative. Report on the findings of four arts therapies trial services 2003-2005*, London: Mental Health Foundation, (2006) - an evaluation of four pilot arts therapy projects with mental health patients in Scotland.

Dooris, Mark, *A qualitative review of Walsall Arts into Health partnership*, *Health Education* 105(5): 355-373. (2005) - a qualitative evaluation of Walsall Arts into Health Partnership.

SAFER AND STRONGER

Murray, Michael and Tilley, Neil, *Promoting safety awareness in fishing communities through community arts: an action research report*, *Safety Science*, 44(9): 797-808, (2006) - action research project investigating use of community arts to raise awareness of health & safety issues in Newfoundland fishing communities.

Gould, Helen G., *A sense of belonging. Arts and culture in the integration of refugees and asylum seekers*. London: Creative Exchange, (2005) - provides a detailed analysis of 33 arts projects involving refugee communities in the UK.

SMARTER

The majority of the 17 studies listed here look at the effects of arts interventions on school age children. The focus of seven of the studies was music, three were concerned with drama, while six involved a range of artforms.

Bryce, Jennifer, Mendelovits, Juliette, Beavis, Adrian, McQueen, Joy, Adams, Isabelle, *Evaluation of school-based arts education programmes in Australian schools*, Online: Australian Council for Educational Research, (2004)

Fitzpatrick, Kate R., *The effect of Instrumental Music Participation and Socioeconomic Status on Ohio Fourth-, Sixth-, and Ninth-Grade Proficiency Test Performance*, *Journal of Research in Music Education* 54(1): 73-84 (2006)

Fujioka, Takako, Ross, Bernhard, Kakigi, Ryusuke, Pantev, Christo, Trainor, Laurel J., *One year of musical training affects development of auditory cortical-evoked fields in young children*, *Brain. A Journal of Neurology*, 129: 2593-2608. (2006)

James, Nalita, *"Actup!" Theatre as education and its impact on young people's learning. CLMS working paper no. 46*, Online: Centre for Labour Market Studies, University of Leicester, (2005)

Lopes da Silva, Joao, and Villas-Boas, Maria Adelina, *Research-note: promoting intercultural education through art education*, *Intercultural Education*, 17(1): 95-103, (2006)

Fleming, Mike, Merrell, Christine, Tymms, Peter, *Impact of drama on pupils' language, mathematics, and attitude in two primary schools*, *Research in Drama Education*, 9(2): 177-197 (2004)

Filmer-Sankey, Caroline, Pye, David, White, Kerensa, *Participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin. A preliminary study*, Slough: National Foundation for Educational Research, (2005)

Northumbria University, *Turning their ears on...keeping their ears open. Exploring the impact of musical activities on the development of pre-school age children*, London: Youth Music, (2006)

Regev, Dafna and Guttman, Joseph, *The psychological benefits of artwork: the case of children with learning disorders*, *The Arts in Psychotherapy*, 32(4): 302-312, (2005)

Schellenberg, E. Glenn, *Long-Term Positive Associations Between Music Lessons and IQ*. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 98(2): 457-468, (2006)

Schellenberg, E Glenn, *Music lessons enhance IQ*, *Psychological Science*, 15(8): 511-514, (2004)

Schlaug, Gottfried, Norton, Andrea, Overy, Kate, Winner, Ellen, *Effects of Music Training on the Child's Brain and cognitive development*, *Annals New York Academy of Sciences*, 1060: 219-230, (2005)

Two studies involve young people from 'socially excluded'/low income/disadvantaged backgrounds:

Wright, Robin, John, Lindsay, Offord, David R., Rowe, William, *Effect of a structured arts program on the psychosocial functioning of youth from low-income communities: Findings from a Canadian longitudinal study*, *The Journal of Early Adolescence*, 26(2), 1-20, (2004)

Arts Council England, *What's the point? Using drama to engage young people at risk*. Manchester: Arts Council England, North West, (2006)

Two studies involve young people in pupil referral or learning support units, and one involves young people on detention and training orders:

Ings, Richard, *Creating chances: arts interventions in pupil referral units and learning support units*, London: Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation, (2004)

Wilkin, Anne, Gulliver, Caroline, Kinder, Kay, *Serious play: an evaluation of arts activities in pupil referral units and learning support units*, London: Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation, (2005)

Nottingham Trent University, Ecotec Research and Consulting, *Access, participation and progression in the arts for young people on Detention and Training Orders*, London: Arts Council England, (2005)

Also of interest, the final report of a five year longitudinal evaluation of the Canadian 'Learning through the Arts' project is due to be published soon. This is funded by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, the Government of Ontario, and two charitable foundations. An earlier report of this project can be found in Patteson, A, Uptis, R, and Smithrim, K, *Learning through the arts. Five year longitudinal study*, Regina, Saskatchewan: The Royal Conservatory of Music, Toronto (2005)